Education continuity during the Coronavirus crisis

Chinese Taipei: Contingency plans for hybrid models of learning

Yi-Hwa Liou and Christopher Petrie
Chinese Taipei: Contingency plans for hybrid models of learning

Author: Yi-Hwa Liou, Associate Professor in the Department of Educational Management at the National Taipei University of Education and Christopher Petrie, Head of Global Research at HundrED.org

Type of intervention: Governmental and Non-governmental
Website:
BEEP Lab
City Wandering Challenge
The Co-Publishing Project

General description

Chinese Taipei has been successful in containing their number of COVID-19 infections to one of the lowest levels in the world. They have used many of the precautions, strategies, and systems developed in prior experiences of the 2003 SARS outbreak and 2009 H1N1 swine flu pandemic. Prevention strategies were prioritised and implemented in the early stages of the coronavirus crisis at the end of December 2019. As a result, Chinese-Taipei experienced minimal disruption to the regular operation of society and education at large.

However, responding to the pandemic necessitated developing a number of policies, plans and central authority initiatives in relation to primary and secondary education. These included, but were not limited to: delaying the start of the spring semester by two weeks, developing class suspension plans if cases were suspected, school entry and exit controls for teachers and students, planning for continuity of teaching and learning, on-site health and safety protocols, and producing a contingency plan for the national assessment.
Alongside central authority initiatives, a number of non-governmental organisations developed contingency plans. The focus of this education continuity story is the central authority action taken to ensure education continuity but reports on three NGO initiatives working to support students to engage with their local and built environments during the crisis are also given as examples of non-governmental engagement:

- **BEEP** (Build Environment Experiential Program) Lab aims to enrich and engage the minds of students and educators through the lens of architecture. BEEP uses design thinking to nurture mastery in creativity, confidence, and collaboration so as to prepare students to be responsible users and designers.

- **City Wandering Challenge** designs programmes for teams of three students who challenge themselves to complete 30 missions within three weeks. The missions encourage students to make the city their classroom and create meaningful growth through interactions with society.

- **The Co-Publishing Project** inspires children from remote schools to use smart phones combined with a “photography formula”. They aim to motivate the learning of students by publishing books of stories with visuals depicting cultural elements from their local area and families.

All three of these NGOs moved to remote activities by providing physical learning kits to students’ homes, developing online alternatives to regular events and using free local applications. They all took place in the context of widespread central authority policies to support hybrid and distance learning and to ensure the system was prepared for school building closures during the health crisis.

**Main problems addressed**

*Ensuring safe classroom environments.* From early on in the crisis, the central authority created and promoted health and safety practices and protocols, such as hand washing, social distancing, personal hygiene, avoidance of being in crowded and closed spaces, and other positive health-related behaviours. Teachers and students were required to wear a face mask in the classroom and keep a social distance of at least 1.5 metres indoors, and 1 metre outdoors. No maximum class sizes were set as long as the classroom windows were kept opened to allow air flow. Distance was also increased between desks, meal times were staggered, and teachers moved between classrooms rather than students moving between classrooms. Schools were expected to clean and disinfect school and classroom environments regularly.

*Continued learning during class or school suspensions.* On 20 February 2020, before the start of the spring semester, the Ministry of Education (MOE) issued a set of standards and procedures for the suspension of in-person classes in the event of confirmed cases of novel coronavirus, in accordance with the recommendations of the Central Epidemic Command Centre (CECC) and health experts. If individual schools had two or more positive COVID-19 cases, all classes and instruction provided on that campus must be suspended for two weeks. If more than a third of educational institutions in one township, county or city were subject to class suspension due to COVID-19, then all the K-12 schools and institutions of higher education in that township, county or city must cease all in-person classes for two weeks. During suspension, schools and universities needed to continue teaching and learning, as well as create a plan for in-person classes to resume with the safety of the students, staff, and surrounding community members at the forefront.

*Contingency planning for national assessment.* As the national high school entry examination for junior high school graduates took place in April and May, the central authority worked with CECC and testing experts on developing guidelines to facilitate the implementation of this nationwide assessment. Action items included: wearing a face mask at all times during the test; checking temperature at the entrance of the test site; no parent or guardian being allowed into testing sites; keeping all windows open 10 centimetres wide to allow air flow in each room with air-conditioning on; frequently cleaning and sanitizing all sites and rest areas; restricting exit and entry of all test sites; and monitoring the health status of those student participants who were in self-quarantine or self-isolation and ensuring their assessment rights.
Alternatives to in-person NGO programmes. Despite the minimal disruption to the normal running of Chinese-Taipei's society, the COVID-19 crisis has nevertheless been described as a "roller-coaster ride" for non-government organisations in education. It became clear early on that any in-person interaction needed to be significantly modified or suspended – which made the health crisis particularly disruptive for NGO educational programmes.

Mobilising and developing resources

Distributing disease prevention resources to all primary and secondary schools. Prior to the start of spring semester, the central authority made sure that each school received the following equipment and resources: infrared forehead thermometer, face masks, and alcohol-based sanitizer. During the semester, the central authority continued to supply these resources to schools and particularly provided large-sized schools (student enrolments of 700 or more) with infrared thermal imaging cameras to expedite the speed of temperature checks as students and educators entered their schools. School-wide surveillance was also strengthened to support early detection and the reporting of suspected cases to local health authorities.

Developing a disease prevention team. Each primary and secondary school was required to create a strategic team of staff from across departments to implement health and safety policies. Each team had a designated spokesperson.

Ensuring students had access to devices and connectivity for learning. Schools were required to check their inventory of usable and loadable technological devices such as tablets, laptops, smart phones, etc., as well as the devices at students' homes that are available to them, and prioritise the distributions of these devices in support of learning and instruction. If schools were in a short supply of some of these devices, they could report to the local authorities and apply for more devices. If the local authorities were short of these supplies, they could apply for loanable devices from the Ministry of Education. In addition to the equipment/devices needed for online/remote learning, the Ministry of Education also built a budget to provide families with discounted data plans or free SIM deals.

Providing flexible leave policies for working parents or guardians with children under 12 years old or identified with disabilities.

Despite measures in the classroom of public schools, the three NGOs mentioned above had to create and implement contingency plans to be able to continue their learning activities. Non-governmental organisations tend to be smaller in scale, and as such, are often more agile to experiment, pivot, and adapt quickly due to their relative size to the public school system. In these cases, they came up with several innovative ways to deliver their programmes in a socially distanced manner:

Providing guidance for setting up home studios. Teachers at BEEP Lab set up a technically advanced home studio to deliver their architecture programme online, although this was an initial challenge. They in turn needed to provide clear guidance to parents and children for setting up their own home studios and provide the necessary materials for families.

Delivering physical learning kits to students' homes. City Wanderer Challenge created kits personalised to each student's role in the challenge (e.g. developing self-confidence to speak in front of people in public spaces). The task assigned for each team member encourages cooperation in unique ways, which also utilises the local region (e.g. public spaces and institutions). A key difficulty with this approach was experimenting with different configurations and processes for making, coordinating and delivering these kits efficiently.

Hiring additional staff and "guides". City Wanderer Challenge hired an intern with the specific task of designing solutions to organise online opening and closing ceremonies of each challenge. To help manage the running of their three-week challenges, they also had the help of "spirit guides" who guided and managed three groups each.
Using free local applications. The Co-publishing project used free local applications LINE and WebEx for communications. They provided additional professional development time for teachers to build their confidence with these technologies.

Fostering effective use and learning

A mix of synchronous and asynchronous learning. School contingency plans outline several action items in response to class suspension including stay-at-home learning and makeup classes. For instance, high school teachers were able to use weekends or summer vacation to make up for any missed classes using remote or online learning. Following the online instruction and learning guidelines issued by the Ministry of Education, elementary and middle schools were encouraged to provide synchronous instruction, asynchronous online personalised learning, and other learning resources for students so they can conduct stay-at-home learning.

Teaching from interesting locations. Some teachers used remote learning to engage their students in learning experiences. For instance, one elementary school social studies teacher provided synchronous instruction via a live streaming from one of the historical places related to her lessons to engage her students with real time learning and experiences of the actual historical site.

Supporting a range of learning platforms. Central and local authorities made sure schools, parents and students were able to access and use online resources such as the CloudEducation learning site (https://cloud.edu.tw/) developed by the Ministry of Education and other online courses provided by local Departments of Education such as Taipei CooC-Cloud, Cooc Teaching Platform, etc. (more resources from the Ministry of Education available at https://learning.cloud.edu.tw/onlinelearning/#k12-sync-learn). Some schools have adopted additional learning platform technologies; some are best used for asynchronous learning, classroom management and communications (e.g., Classting, Adaptive Learning from the CloudEducation site, Juiker, LINE, LearnMode, PagamO, etc.), while some are suited for a mixture of synchronous and asynchronous instruction (Google Meet, Jitsi Meet, Microsoft Teams, Cisco WebEx, YouTube, etc.).

Providing teacher training. Teachers were provided with training that helped them understand what and how to use each of these platforms. In addition, teachers were also able to select the kind of platform that they felt the most comfortable and confident in using with students and parents.

Addressing achievement gaps. In facilitating (a)synchronous online or remote learning, schools needed to attend to the learning needs of all students, and thus developed remedial education programmes for higher- and lower-achievers. These programmes offer additional short-term courses on core school subjects (language and mathematics) which took place in-between class periods, after school, and/or during the summer. The courses were designed in a way that imbued learning with fun activities through differentiated teaching strategies, co-teaching, team learning, and mobile learning, etc. to ensure additional learning needs of students were met.

NGOs delivering hybrid learning modules. BEEP Lab developed self-paced “hybrid” learning modules in addition to synchronous teaching where students have the opportunity to ask questions. They offered not only synchronous video streaming that addressed students’ learning needs in real time, but also channels such as the Facebook messenger that allowed students to send messages of questions about their project. This helped students have time to focus on mastering knowledge and skills required in each stage of learning for their project.

Involvement of parents/guardians. The intentional involvement of parents became a major silver lining of the implementation strategy for BEEP Lab and Co-publishing Project. Before the pandemic, the majority of parents rarely got involved with their children's learning. However, because adult help was now required to ensure the smooth operation of lessons, the opportunity to deepen the relationship between the educator, parent, and student arose, which also supported social and emotional learning.
Finding alternative learning challenges. The City Wanderer Challenge experimented with alternative ways to support students to grow and overcome personal boundaries on their missions without the presence of a live audience or group of people. One example of this is for students to broadcast a live video online to demonstrate how they have managed to develop their own way of active participation and connection with the society in initiating change. However, this process comes with unique challenges they are working through, such as privacy concerns and the potential permanence of a digital footprint, and limited scale of change that can be accomplished without the in-person support of team mates.

Implementation challenges

Central authority and school level

Several challenges arose during the implementation stage of implementing policies and measures for public schools to ensure educational continuity. These included:

1. Coordinating efforts between central and local authorities in prioritising the distribution of learning resources, such as technology equipment/devices, and at the same time working together with major telecommunication services carriers to provide smart devices, 4G network, and home networking packages.
2. Integrating online learning resources provided by public and private sectors, and making these resources accessible to students and teachers.
3. Planning nationwide operational exercises and drills for online teaching and learning, and ensuring all schools have access to online learning resources and were able to execute them.
4. Although there have been structural procedures in place for case reporting, health screening, resource distributions, etc., some of these procedures can be further simplified at the school level not only to reduce the workflow of school administrators but also to increase efficiency and effectiveness in preventative practices. “We do not want to overwhelm our schools during this crisis but we made sure not to take shortcuts that may lead to an outbreak”, said the Director-General of K-12 Education Administration (Ministry of Education).
5. Despite all these efforts, teachers expressed the need for more direct guidance and professional development in order to equip them with the skills and competencies necessary for the implementation of a fully student-centred, self-directed learning approach.

Non-governmental organisation level

The pressure to quickly adapt to sudden restrictions and notify parents about their plans was a stressful experience for NGOs, particularly because there were no assurances that any experimentation to overcome these restrictions would work. The initial planning stage involved addressing learning challenges, which included:

1. Fostering social-emotional skills like empathy, cooperation, and collaboration between students as core to the value they deliver.
2. Facilitating spontaneous interactions.
3. Developing 21st century skills like design thinking, architecture education.
4. Providing activities that involved overcoming personal barriers.
5. Promoting team building and deep reflection activities.
6. Logistics: packaging and delivering learning kits to students’ homes; managing different types of channels to communicate with parents; moving and purchasing equipment to build a home studio; etc.
Monitoring success

At the central authority level, measures have been taken since February 2020 to ensure preventive practices were carried out at the local school level as mandated. The initial strategy included establishing strategic teams of central authority officials to supervise primary and secondary schools’ implementation of health and safety procedures. From February to April 2020, the teams have visited 187 public schools in person and made telephone supervision arrangements with 38 schools across approximately 22 cities and counties. Regional superintendents have also exercised supervision over the schools in their region to evaluate the effectiveness of their preventative practices.

From the NGO perspective, monitoring and assessing progress was supported through increased interactions and check-ins with parents. Some of the significant action taken during this time of pandemic to monitor the preventive practices includes: check and record the temperature of students and staff three times a day (self reporting temperature for the City Wanderer), disinfecting learning tools and environments multiple times a day, etc. However, no additional barriers were reported in assessing progress that were not in place prior to the pandemic.

Adaptability to new contexts

These solutions can be implemented in any setting and bring several lessons that can inform their adaptability to new contexts. As the COVID-19 pandemic and economic disruptions are changing the landscape for education globally, it is important to use co-operation, communication, and exchange of ideas to understand what this means for schools, practitioners, families and communities, as well as policymakers and how each of these parties can respond and evolve in this crisis situation.

Ensuring equity in online and distance learning. The COVID-19 outbreak has made equity an even more central concern when it comes to remote education. As schools prepare themselves for remote education, it is imperative to address any equity issues, such as access to technology or online tools, and consistent high-speed internet. Resources need to be prioritised accordingly so that the inequalities exposed by the COVID-19 crisis are not exacerbated.

Ensuring social and emotional well-being of teachers and students. When preparing for or transitioning to online or remote learning models, the social and emotional well-being of students and teachers should also be of the highest priority. Structures that can be put in place to address the well-being of students and teachers include: (1) making sure the basic needs of students (stable home environments, health, and access to education) and teachers (safe workplace, access to technology and digital tools and being able to use them, etc.) are met, (2) establishing clear routines for communications and encouraging prosocial behaviours, (3) providing social and counselling services to students, staff and communities, (4) prioritising relationship building and psychosocial well-being over tasks and assignments, and (5) creating innovative ways to increase connectivity among and between students, teachers, and parents/guardians.

Ensuring efficiency and effectiveness in the operation of health and safety practices. The central authority has been able to effectively minimise the spread of COVID-19 by issuing sets of well-planned national policy mandates and prioritising the distribution of resources needed for health and safety practices.

Design of self-paced/-directed learning and instruction. The use of tech-supported, self-directed learning has become one of the core instructional practices for teachers during this pandemic. However, adopting this style of education systematically across the school is not a simple transition. Together, teachers and parents can facilitate students to be independent learners by giving them more time to self-discover learning opportunities from daily life, such as running scientific observations with the objects around their home. In some schools, teachers are encouraged to provide (asynchronous or synchronous) online learning opportunities to their students during weekends as a way to simulate the lockdown situation, hone their skills in making personalised assignments, and ensure their students have access to online resources in support of their learning.
Changes in student learning assessments. When schools work towards the adoption of remote education or blended learning strategies, they often face a challenge of differentiation in instruction, learning, and assessments. As with face-to-face instruction, teachers need to attend to students’ different learning styles, preferences, levels and needs in the remote learning space. Some students may fall off the grid, while others face barriers to accessing course content or completing course assignments online, such as a lack of internet access or unstable home environments. These challenges require teachers to create alternative learning assessments that can effectively diagnose the learning progress of students.

Integration of virtual and in-person professional collaboration. Such changes to teaching and learning create a pressing need for teacher professional development. One of the strategies that have been widely used globally before the outbreak for capacity building is collegial collaboration. In the new teaching context, many teachers realise they cannot do it alone, so a shift towards a more collaborative mindset to learn from colleagues, plan together and share resources via virtual professional communities, could be witnessed.

Key points to keep in mind for a successful adaptation

1. Develop contingency plans in response to pandemic crisis that are made in accordance with the recommendations by health experts, including requiring all schools to implement on-site health and safety measures.

2. Distribute disease prevention resources to all schools and continue to do so during and after the outbreak.

3. Create a disease prevention team at the school level to promote and implement health and safety protocols, and also to be a focal point in disseminating disease prevention information, monitoring the health status of students and staff, and reporting suspicious cases.

4. Complete an inventory of existing learning resources that are available to teachers and students in their home, and prioritise the distribution of these resources in support of learning and instruction.

5. Develop and implement flexible leave policies for working parents or guardians with children under 12 years old or identified with disabilities so that they can provide immediate support for their children’s learning at home.

6. Provide timely and adequate training that teachers need in order to be ready for planning, designing and implementing high-quality online courses and learning assessments.

7. Continue to monitor the social and emotional well-being of school staff and students.

8. Decrease cash flow dependence on physical face-to-face events for educational NGOs. One way to achieve this is to build the capacity for hybrid teaching methods. For example, self-paced hybrid pedagogy where students can progress with a mastery style of learning. Another example is to deliver home learning kits to students.

Acknowledgements

We wish to especially acknowledge the contributions of the Director-General of K-12 Education Administration (Ministry of Education), the selected schools and non-governmental organisations for their invaluable and unique perspectives and practices that inform the work of this report. We would also like to acknowledge the support of HundrED.org (a Finland based education non-profit) and Sayling Wen Cultural and Educational Foundation (a Chinese-Taipei non-governmental and non-profit organisation) without which this report would not have been possible.
References


Ng, C. Y., & Brook, R. H. (2020). Response to COVID-19 in Taiwan: Big data analytics, new technology, and proactive testing. JAMA, 323(14), 1341–1342.


taiwan centers for disease control (2020, February 2). In response to the outbreak of 2019 Novel Coronavirus (2019-nCoV) in China, Central Epidemic Command Center (CECC) decides that all primary and secondary schools postpone first day of spring semester until 2 weeks later. Taiwan Centers for Disease Control, Retrieved from https://www.cdc.gov.tw/En/Bulletin/Detail/ZXq7cwUw7JlpVwyfHalGKw?tipoeid=158

taiwan centers for disease control (2020, July 9). Prevention and Control of COVID-19 in Taiwan. Taiwan Centers for Disease Control, Retrieved from https://www.cdc.gov.tw/En/Category/Page/0vq8rsAop_9HCi5GQ5JH1Q


These papers should not be reported as representing the official views of the convening organisations OECD, the World Bank, or their corresponding member countries, HundrED, and Harvard Graduate School of Education. The opinions expressed and arguments employed are those of the authors. Comment on the series is welcome, and should be sent to edu.contact@oecd.org.

This document and any map included herein are without prejudice to the status of or sovereignty over any territory, to the delimitation of international frontiers and boundaries and to the name of any territory, city or area.

Except where otherwise noted, content in this work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 IGO (CC BYNC-SA 3.0 IGO). For specific information regarding the scope and terms of the licence as well as possible commercial use of this work or the use of PISA data please consult Terms and Conditions on www.oecd.org.